

Contents

Contributors in this issue

Editorial

1.	A Theory of Collective Person: The Vision of Social Formation in the <i>Bhagavadgītā</i>	1
	Binod K. Agarwala	
2.	Situating Kabir's Non-Conformism in the Contemporary Philosophical Milieu: A Historical Analysis	38
	Heramb Chaturvedi	
3.	Apropos of 'Daya Ji's Last Written Piece'	48
	Ravindra K. S. Choudhary	
4.	Supervenience Physicalism and Its Faltering Fortunes	60
	Ravindra M. Singh	
5.	Descartes' Four-Fold Ways to Address Mental Sufferings	80
	Indoo Pandey Khanduri	
6.	Provisional Scepticism, Cogito and Certainty	92
	B. Ananda Sagar	
7.	Value of Error in Indian Philosophy	101
	Purnima Das	
8.	'Not' Again: Negative Facts Revived to Sustain Russell's Principle of Analysis	105
	Monica Prabhakar	
9.	A Re-Assessment of Orthodox and Liberal Scholarship on the Philosophical Position of Gaudapāda	124
	V. Sujata Raju	
10.	Understanding Selfishness and Sense of Justice through the Theory of Evolution	144
	Jagdish Rai	

iv

v

1

38

48

60

80

92

101

105

124

144



Department of Philosophy University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

2023

Journal of Foundational Research

Editorial Board

Abha Singh, Professor, Patliputra University, Patna
Ambika Datta Sharma, Professor, Harisingh Gour University, Sagar
Asha Mukherjee, Ex-Professor, Visva-bharati, Shantiniketan
Ashok Vohra, Ex-Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Balaganapathi Devarakonda, Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Daniel Raveh, Professor, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel
Dilipkumar Mohanta, Professor, Calcutta University, Kolkata
H. S. Prasad, Ex-Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Indoo Pandey Khanduri, Professor, HNB Garhwal University, Srinagar
Jatashankar, Ex-Professor, University of Allahabad, Prayagraj
J. L. Shaw, Ex-Professor, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
P. K. Mukhopadhyay, Ex-Professor, Jadavpur University, Kolkata
P. P. Gokhale, Ex-Professor, SP Pune University, Pune
P. R. Bhat, Ex-Professor, IIT Bombay, Mumbai
Raghunath Ghosh, Ex-Professor, North Bengal University, Darjeeling
Rajaneesh Shukla, Vice Chancellor, MGA Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Wardha
Ramesh Chandra Sinha, Ex-Chairperson ICPR, New Delhi
S. Pannerselvam, Ex-Professor, University of Madras, Chennai

Founder Editor

Biswambhar Pahi, Late Ex-Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Chief Editor

Arvind Vikram Singh, Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Editor

Anubhav Varshney, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Associate Editors

Manish Sinsinwar, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Manish Gothwal, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

The *Journal of Foundational Research* is published biannually, in January and July by the Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004, Rajasthan, India.

No paper in this Journal or any part of it may be reproduced, without the publisher's written permission. The present issue was published in January 2023, with partial financial assistance from University of Rajasthan.

Submission of manuscripts

Submissions to the *Journal of Foundational Research* must be made through online submission link available at: www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in or at editorjfruniraj@gmail.com

Instructions for contributors can be found at the aforementioned website and at the back of this issue.

Price: INR 150 (Individual)
INR 300 (Institution)

Printed by: Technocrat Printers Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur

Submission Guidelines and Other Information

- a. **Language:** The paper could be in either English or Hindi or Sanskrit.
- b. **Originality of the paper:** The paper must not have been previously published elsewhere, nor should it be under-consideration or under-publication in another journal. The authors are requested to undertake a plagiarism check before submission. If the paper has been adapted from one's own doctoral or post-doctoral work, the same must be duly acknowledged. In case of any discrepancy of the sort pertaining to this and/or any other guideline, the legal onus shall lie entirely with the author.
- c. **Review of submissions:** Submitted paper shall undergo double blind review and published subsequent to referee reports.
- d. **Blinded Manuscript:** The paper must be submitted anonymously to enable blind review, following the submission link available on the journal's website. The manuscript must not bear name or other identities of the author(s). The name, institutional affiliation, mail-address for correspondence, may be submitted in a separate document, i.e., the title page.
- e. **Abstract and Keywords:** An abstract of around 150 words and 3-8 keywords must be added at the beginning of the main text.
- f. **Main Text:** Kindly use end-noting. Notes and references must follow the same style as the remaining of the manuscript. Kindly avoid lengthy end-notes, keeping the same to a minimum.
- g. **Referencing:** MLA or Chicago style may kindly be preferred.
- h. **Font style:** For English, kindly follow Cambria or Times New Roman, font size 12, 1.5 spacing. For Hindi, Kruti Dev font style is preferred.
- i. **Interdisciplinary Papers:** Only such interdisciplinary papers shall be considered which have to do primarily with philosophy or unravel a fresh intersection of another discipline with philosophy. Contributors making interdisciplinary submissions must avoid jargon and nuances of other disciplines.
- j. **Length of paper:** Normally papers (inclusive of notes and references) exceeding 10,000 words shall not be accepted.
- k. **After Review:** The authors will be communicated changes if any and given a time period of not more than five days to make the moderations.
- l. **After Acceptance:** The authors will be intimated and may be mailed a paper-set soft copy of manuscript for proof reading. The same must be done within five days. Only minor changes shall be entertained at this stage.
- m. **Author's copy:** Contributing authors shall receive for free a soft-copy and a hard copy of the issue incorporating their paper.

Research Notes and Comments: The journal welcomes brief research notes and comments upon research articles published in it. Such comments will be open for rejoinders by the original author. Normally, no more than two round of comments and rejoinders will be allowed. Such comments and rejoinders must be brief and must not exceed 1000 words. Set of instructions and procedure for publication of notes and comments/rejoinders is same as that for full-fledged articles.

Request to Authors: The authors are requested to bear in mind that it may take over a year for a final decision on their submission. As such, the authors are sincerely requested not to make any inquiries on their submission before a year.

Journal Submission, Subscription and Enquiry

Submission Link:

Blind manuscript, along with a separate title page may be mailed for consideration to editorjfruniraj@gmail.com

Subscription Fee:

Subscription Type	Individual	Institution
Single Issue	INR 150/-	INR 300/-
Annual	INR 300/-	INR 600/-
Seven Years	INR 2000/-	INR 4000/-

Subscription Form may be downloaded from the Download section of the journal's website. Duly filled forms may be mailed at editorjfruniraj@gmail.com or hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com or sent to the Head, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004, through post.

Payment Mode- NEFT of the requisite amount may be made in favour of "Seminar and Students Fund, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan Jaipur", A/C No.-674701702067, IFSC-ICIC0006747, ICICI Bank, Bapu Nagar Branch, Jaipur. NEFT details must be mentioned in the form.

Contributors shall get a hard-copy of the issue consisting of their paper, for free.

Contact the Journal:

For submission or publication related inquiries mails be sent to hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com or editorjfruniraj@gmail.com

Journal's website : www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in

Journal of Foundational Research

Volume XXXI, Number I-January 2023

ISSN 2395-5635

UGC-CARE Indexed

Chief Editor

Arvind Vikram Singh

Editor

Anubhav Varshney

Associate Editors

Manish Sinsinwar

Manish Gothwal



**Department of Philosophy
University of Rajasthan, Jaipur**

2023

Journal of Foundational Research

Editorial Board

Abha Singh, Professor, Patliputra University, Patna
Ambika Datta Sharma, Professor, Harisingh Gour University, Sagar
Asha Mukherjee, Ex-Professor, Visva-bharati, Shantiniketan
Ashok Vohra, Ex-Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Balaganapathi Devarakonda, Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Daniel Raveh, Professor, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel
Dilipkumar Mohanta, Professor, Calcutta University, Kolkata
H. S. Prasad, Ex-Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi
Indoo Pandey Khanduri, Professor, HNB Garhwal University, Srinagar
Jatashankar, Ex-Professor, University of Allahabad, Prayagraj
J. L. Shaw, Ex-Professor, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand
P. K. Mukhopadhyay, Ex-Professor, Jadavpur University, Kolkata
P. P. Gokhale, Ex-Professor, SP Pune University, Pune
P. R. Bhat, Ex-Professor, IIT Bombay, Mumbai
Raghunath Ghosh, Ex-Professor, North Bengal University, Darjeeling
Rajaneesh Shukla, Vice Chancellor, MGA Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Wardha
Ramesh Chandra Sinha, Ex-Chairperson ICPR, New Delhi
S. Pannerselvam, Ex-Professor, University of Madras, Chennai

Founder Editor

Biswambhar Pahi, Late Ex-Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Chief Editor

Arvind Vikram Singh, Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Editor

Anubhav Varshney, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Associate Editors

Manish Sinsinwar, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Manish Gothwal, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

The *Journal of Foundational Research* is published biannually, in January and July by the Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004, Rajasthan, India.

No paper in this Journal or any part of it may be reproduced, without the publisher's written permission. The present issue was published in January 2023, with partial financial assistance from University of Rajasthan.

Submission of manuscripts

Submissions to the *Journal of Foundational Research* must be made through online submission link available at: www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in or at editorjfruniraj@gmail.com

Instructions for contributors can be found at the aforementioned website and at the back of this issue.

Price: INR 150 (Individual)

INR 300 (Institution)

Printed by: Technocrat Printers Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur

Contents

Contributors in this issue	iv
Editorial	v
1. A Theory of Collective Person: The Vision of Social Formation in the <i>Bhagavadgītā</i> Binod K. Agarwala	1
2. Situating Kabir's Non-Conformism in the Contemporary Philosophical Milieu: A Historical Analysis Heramb Chaturvedi	38
3. Apropos of 'Daya Ji's Last Written Piece' Ravindra K. S. Choudhary	48
4. Supervenience Physicalism and Its Faltering Fortunes Ravindra M. Singh	60
5. Descartes' Four-Fold Ways to Address Mental Sufferings Indoo Pandey Khanduri	80
6. Provisional Scepticism, Cogito and Certainty B. Ananda Sagar	92
7. Value of Error in Indian Philosophy Purnima Das	101
8. 'Not' Again: Negative Facts Revived to Sustain Russell's Principle of Analysis Monica Prabhakar	105
9. A Re-Assessment of Orthodox and Liberal Scholarship on the Philosophical Position of Gauḍapāda V. Sujata Raju	124
10. Understanding Selfishness and Sense of Justice through Theory of Evolution Jagdish Rai	144

Contributors in this Volume

Binod K. Agarwala
Ex-Professor
Department of Philosophy
North-Eastern Hill University, Shillong

Heramb Chaturvedi
Historian and Litterateur
Ex-Professor
Department of Medieval and Modern History
University of Allahabad, Prayagraj

Ravindra K. S. Choudhary
Professor
Department of Philosophy
SKM University, Dumka, Jharkhand

Ravindra M. Singh
Associate Professor
Department of Philosophy
University of Delhi, New Delhi

Indoo Pandey Khanduri
Professor
Department of Philosophy
HNB Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand

B. Ananda Sagar
Assistant Professor
Department of Philosophy
University of Hyderabad, Hyderabad

Purnima Das
Assistant Professor
Maynaguri College
Maynaguri, Jalpaiguri, West Bengal

Monica Prabhakar
Associate Professor
Daulat Ram College
University of Delhi, New Delhi

V. Sujata Raju
Associate Professor
Daulat Ram College
University of Delhi, New Delhi

Jagdish Rai
Assistant Professor for Forensic Biological Sciences
Panjab University, Chandigarh