

## Contents

### Editorial

### Contributors in this volume

1. **My Statement of Philosophy and a Response to My Critics** **1**  
**1. Biswambhar Pahi**
2. **Artha as a Parama-puruṣārtha** **15**  
**2. Raghunath Ghosh**
3. **Jñāna-karmā-sammuccayavāda or asammuccayavāda in the Bhagavadgītā** **26**  
**3. Binod K. Agarwala**
4. **Hilary Putnam on Internal Realism** **80**  
**4. Kantilal Das**
5. **Concept of Happiness in Buddhism** **97**  
**5. Abha Singh**
6. **Becoming Social: Vivekananda and the Spiritual Turn** **103**  
**6. Pralayankar Bhattacharyya**
7. **The Problems of Consciousness: Wittgenstein's Response** **119**  
**7. Laimayum Bishwanath Sharma**
8. **Contented Development: The Buddhist Model** **129**  
**8. Patitpaban Das**
9. **Kant- Quine Controversy Regarding Analyticity** **140**  
**9. Pratibha Sharma**
10. **Structuralism and Semiotics: Tracing the Journey of Sign** **155**  
**10. Arvind Vikram Singh and Jaishree Bareth**
11. **Drṣtānta and Universal Concomitance in Indian Logic: From the Empirical to the Rational to the Empirico-Rational standpoints** **166**  
**11. Prashanth B. and Padmakumar P. R.**
12. **Moral Dilemma-The Way Out** **189**  
**12. Saroj Kanta Kar**
13. **Virtual Reality and Reality-Virtuality Continuum: An Avenue and Agenda for Research in Cyber and Philosophy** **203**  
**13. Chaturbhuj Sharma**
14. **Dayakrishna on Structure of Freedom** **208**  
**14. Manish Gothwal**

## JOURNAL OF FOUNDATIONAL RESEARCH

Volume XXIX, I & II, Joint Issue of January and July 2021

Peer-Reviewed

ISSN 2395-5635

UGC-CARE Listed

Chief Editor  
Arvind Vikram Singh

Editor

Anubhav Varshney

Associate Editors

Manish Sinsinwar

Manish Gothwal



Department of Philosophy

University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

2021



# JOURNAL OF FOUNDATIONAL RESEARCH

## Editorial Board

Abha Singh, Professor, Patliputra University, Patna  
Ambika Datta Sharma, Professor, Harisingh Gour University, Sagar  
Asha Mukherjee, Ex. Professor, Visva-bharati, Shantiniketan  
Ashok Vohra, Ex. Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Balaganapathi Devarakonda, Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Daniel Raveh, Professor, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel  
H. S. Prasad, Ex. Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Indoo Pandey Khanduri, Professor, HNB Garhwal University, Srinagar  
Jatashankar, Ex. Professor, University of Allahabad, Prayagraj  
J. L. Shaw, Ex. Professor, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand  
P. K. Mukhopadhyay, Ex. Professor, Jadavpur University, Kolkata  
P. P. Gokhale, Ex. Professor, SP Pune University, Pune  
P. R. Bhat, Ex. Professor, IIT Bombay, Mumbai  
Raghunath Ghosh, Ex. Professor, North Bengal University, Darjeeling  
Rajaneesh Shukla, Vice Chancellor, MGA Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Wardha  
Ramesh Chandra Sinha, Hon'ble Chairperson ICPR, New Delhi  
S. Pannerselvam, Ex. Professor, University of Madras, Chennai

## Chief Editor

Arvind Vikram Singh, Head, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan,  
Jaipur

## Editor

Anubhav Varshney, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

## Associate Editors

Manish Sinsinwar, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

Manish Gothwal, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

The *Journal of Foundational Research* is published biannually, in January and July by the Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004 (Rajasthan), India. No paper in this Journal or any part of it may be reproduced, without the publisher's written permission.

## Submission of manuscripts

Submissions to the *Journal of Foundational Research* must be made through online submission link available at: [www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in](http://www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in) or at [editorjfruniraj@gmail.com](mailto:editorjfruniraj@gmail.com)

Instructions for contributors can be found at the aforementioned website and at the back of this issue.

Price: INR 150 (Individual)  
INR 300 (Institution)

*The present issue was published in July 2021*

Printed by: Technocrat Printers Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur

## Submission Guidelines and Other Information

- a. Language:** The paper could be in either English or Hindi or Sanskrita.
- b. Originality of the paper:** The paper must not have been previously published elsewhere, nor should it be under-consideration or under-publication in another journal. The authors are requested to undertake a plagiarism check before submission. If the paper has been adapted from one's own doctoral or post-doctoral work, the same must be duly acknowledged. In case of any discrepancy of the sort pertaining to this and/or any other guideline, the legal onus shall lie entirely with the author.
- c. Review of submissions:** Submitted paper shall undergo double blind review and published subsequent to referee reports.
- d. Blinded Manuscript:** The paper must be submitted anonymously to enable blind review, following the submission link available on the journal's website. The manuscript must not bear name or other identities of the author(s). The name, institutional affiliation, mail-address for correspondence, may be submitted in a separate document, i.e., the title page.
- e. Title Page:** The title page should bear the following information, apart from the title-  
1.) the name(s) of the author(s),  
2.) The affiliation(s) of the author(s) and  
3.) an active e-mail address of the author(s).
- f. Abstract and Keywords:** An abstract of around 150 words and 3-8 keywords must be added at the beginning of the main text.
- g. Main Text:** Kindly use end-noting, Notes and references must follow the same style as the remaining of the manuscript. Kindly avoid lengthy end-notes, keeping the same to a minimum.
- h. Referencing:** MLA or Chicago style may kindly be preferred.
- i. Font style:** For English, kindly follow Cambria or Times New Roman, font size 12, 1.5 spacing. For Hindi, Kruti Dev font style is preferred.
- j. Interdisciplinary Papers:** Only such interdisciplinary papers shall be considered which have to do primarily with philosophy or unravel a fresh intersection of another discipline with philosophy. Contributors making interdisciplinary submissions must avoid jargon and nuances of other disciplines.
- k. Length of paper:** Normally papers (inclusive of notes and references) exceeding 10,000 words shall not be accepted.
- l. After Review:** The authors will be communicated changes if any and given a time period of not more than five days to make the moderations.
- m. After Acceptance:** The authors will be intimated and may be mailed a paper-set soft copy of manuscript for proof reading. The same must be done within five days. Only minor changes shall be entertained at this stage.
- n. Author's copy:** Contributing authors shall receive for free a soft-copy and a hard copy of the issue incorporating their paper.

## Journal Submission, Subscription and Enquiry

### Submission Link:

Blind manuscript, along with a separate title page may be mailed for consideration to [editorjfruniraj@gmail.com](mailto:editorjfruniraj@gmail.com)

### Subscription Fee:

Subscription Type	Individual	Institution
Single Issue	INR 150/-	INR 300/-
Annual	INR 300/-	INR 600/-
Seven Years	INR 2000/-	INR 4000/-

Subscription Form may be downloaded from the Download section of the journal's website. Duly filled forms may be mailed at [editorjfruniraj@gmail.com](mailto:editorjfruniraj@gmail.com) or [hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com](mailto:hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com) or sent to the Head, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004, through post.

**Payment Mode-** NEFT of the requisite amount may be made in favour of "Seminar and Students Fund, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan Jaipur", A/C No.- 674701702067, IFSC-ICIC0006747, ICICI Bank, Bapu Nagar Branch, Jaipur, NEFT details must be mentioned in the form.

Contributors shall get a hard-copy of the issue consisting of their paper, for free.

### Contact the Journal:

For submission or publication related inquiries mails be sent to [hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com](mailto:hodphilosophyuniraj@gmail.com) or [editorjfruniraj@gmail.com](mailto:editorjfruniraj@gmail.com)

**Journal's website :** [www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in](http://www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in)

# **JOURNAL OF FOUNDATIONAL RESEARCH**

Volume XXIX. I & II. Joint Issue of January and July 2021

Peer-Reviewed  
ISSN 2395-5635

UGC-CARE Listed

## **Chief Editor**

Arvind Vikram Singh

## **Editor**

Anubhav Varshney

## **Associate Editors**

Manish Sinsinwar

Manish Gothwal



**Department of Philosophy**  
**University of Rajasthan, Jaipur**  
**2021**

# JOURNAL OF FOUNDATIONAL RESEARCH

## **Editorial Board**

Abha Singh, Professor, Patliputra University, Patna  
Ambika Datta Sharma, Professor, Harisingh Gour University, Sagar  
Asha Mukherjee, Ex. Professor, Visva-bharati, Shantiniketan  
Ashok Vohra, Ex. Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Balaganapathi Devarakonda, Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Daniel Raveh, Professor, Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel  
H. S. Prasad, Ex. Professor, University of Delhi, New Delhi  
Indoo Pandey Khanduri, Professor, HNB Garhwal University, Srinagar  
Jatashankar, Ex. Professor, University of Allahabad, Prayagraj  
J. L. Shaw, Ex. Professor, Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand  
P. K. Mukhopadhyay, Ex. Professor, Jadavpur University, Kolkata  
P. P. Gokhale, Ex. Professor, SP Pune University, Pune  
P. R. Bhat, Ex. Professor, IIT Bombay, Mumbai  
Raghunath Ghosh, Ex. Professor, North Bengal University, Darjeeling  
Rajaneesh Shukla, Vice Chancellor, MGA Hindi Vishwavidyalaya, Wardha  
Ramesh Chandra Sinha, Hon'ble Chairperson ICPR, New Delhi  
S. Pannerselvam, Ex. Professor, University of Madras, Chennai

## **Chief Editor**

Arvind Vikram Singh, Head, Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan,  
Jaipur

## **Editor**

Anubhav Varshney, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

## **Associate Editors**

Manish Sinsinwar, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur  
Manish Gothwal, Assistant Professor, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur

The *Journal of Foundational Research* is published biannually, in January and July by the Department of Philosophy, University of Rajasthan, Jaipur-302004 (Rajasthan), India. No paper in this Journal or any part of it may be reproduced, without the publisher's written permission.

### *Submission of manuscripts*

Submissions to the *Journal of Foundational Research* must be made through online submission link available at: [www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in](http://www.unirajphilosophy.ac.in) or at [editorjfruniraj@gmail.com](mailto:editorjfruniraj@gmail.com)

Instructions for contributors can be found at the aforementioned website and at the back of this issue.

Price: INR 150 (Individual)  
INR 300 (Institution)

*The present issue was published in July 2021*

*Printed by: Technocrat Printers Pvt. Ltd., Jaipur*



## Contents

Editorial	v
Contributors in this volume	vii
1. My Statement of Philosophy and a Response to My Critics <b>Biswambhar Pahi</b>	1
2. <i>Artha</i> as a <i>Parama-puruṣārtha</i> <b>Raghunath Ghosh</b>	15
3. <i>Jñāna-karma-sammuccayavāda</i> or - <i>asammuccayavāda</i> in the <i>Bhagavadgītā</i> <b>Binod K. Agarwala</b>	26
4. Hilary Putnam on Internal Realism <b>Kantilal Das</b>	80
5. Concept of Happiness in Buddhism <b>Abha Singh</b>	97
6. Becoming Social: Vivekananda and the Spiritual Turn <b>Pralayankar Bhattacharyya</b>	103
7. The Problems of Consciousness: Wittgenstein's Response <b>Laimayum Bishwanath Sharma</b>	119
8. Contented Development: The Buddhist Model <b>Patitpaban Das</b>	129
9. Kant- Quine Controversy Regarding Analyticity <b>Pratibha Sharma</b>	140
10. Structuralism and Semiotics: Tracing the Journey of Sign <b>Arvind Vikram Singh and Jaishree Bareth</b>	155
11. <i>Dr̥ṣṭānta</i> and Universal Concomitance in Indian Logic: From the Empirical to the Rational to the Empirico-Rational standpoints <b>Prashanth B. and Padmakumar P. R.</b>	166

12. Moral Dilemma-The Way Out  
**Saroj Kanta Kar** 189
13. Virtual Reality and Reality-Virtuality  
Continuum: An Avenue and Agenda for  
Research in Cyber and Philosophy  
**Chaturbhuj Sharma** 203
14. Dayakrishna on Structure of Freedom  
**Manish Gothwal** 208